

Nordic-Baltic Campaign Against Trafficking in Women in Estonia 2002-2003 Report

Content:

- 1. Background of the campaign**
- 2. Comments on joint activities**
- 3. Legal framework**
- 4. National activities**
- 5. Cooperation with NGO's**
- 6. Evaluation of effects of joint and national activities**
- 7. Other perceived effects of Nordic Baltic Campaign and national campaigns – regionally and nationally**
- 8. Future work against trafficking in women**
- 9. Recommendations for the future collaboration in the region and nationally.**

1. Background of the campaign

In June 2001, at the *Women and Democracy* conference in Vilnius, the Nordic and Baltic Ministers of Gender Equality decided, by the proposal of Swedish Minister of Gender Equality Margareta Winberg, to carry out a joint Nordic-Baltic information campaign against trafficking in women. In August 2001, the Nordic and Baltic Ministers of Justice decided to join the campaign. The campaign was planned and implemented by a Nordic Baltic Working Group against Trafficking in Women. 16 members of the working group were from the Nordic-Baltic Ministries of Gender Equality and Justice, four of them were additional national coordinators. Two participants from the Nordic Council of Ministers office in Copenhagen and three participants from the NCM Information Offices in the Baltic countries acted as observers. Working groups' Estonian members were Ülle-Marika Papp from the Ministry of Social Affairs, and Imbi Markus from the Ministry of Justice. Kristiina Luht was hired for the Estonian national coordinator's position.

The Executive Committee on Gender Equality of the Nordic Council of Ministers adopted, on January 16, 2002, a document setting out the objectives of the Campaign. The Committee decided that the Campaign should aim to increase knowledge and awareness among the public, and to initiate discussion about the problems surrounding the issue of trafficking in women.

The Working Group decided at its first meeting, on February 21, 2002, to use the United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and its definition of trafficking as a point of reference for the Campaign, as well as for the national campaigns.

The goal of the Estonian campaign against trafficking in women was to start discussion about the problems surrounding the issue of trafficking in women and prostitution, and to start changing existing attitudes. Also, the aim was to investigate

the situation in Estonia regarding trafficking in women, and to raise selected target groups' awareness on trafficking in women and prostitution.

The basis of the Estonian campaign was planned by a group of researchers, NGO representatives, and the Bureau of Equality at the Ministry of Social Affairs. The campaign was organised by the national coordinator and different cooperation partners, mostly NGOs. NCM information bureau in Tallinn helped by consulting and technical issues.

The whole campaign was launched on May 29, 2002, in Tallinn, Estonia, with a two-day seminar on trafficking in women. The research-part of the Estonian campaign also started in May. Preparation of training courses, lectures and other activities lasted through summer, and the educational part of the campaign started in September 2002. Lectures continued in January 2003, including the final training seminar for teachers and youth workers. The final activity of the campaign, a seminar for high authorities and governmental officials, giving them an overview of the work done in Estonia during the campaign, took place in March 10, 2003.

2. Comments on joint activities

a. Joint seminars

The first joint seminar "*Trafficking in Women as Modern Slave Trading*", was held in Tallinn, Estonia on 29- 31 May 2002, and it was the official opening of the whole Nordic-Baltic campaign. Main topics of the seminar were women's status, the role of media, and legislation. Among speakers were Ministers on gender equality from Estonia, Finland, Sweden and Norway.

The second joint seminar "*Protection and Support of Victims of Trafficking*" was organised in Vilnius, Lithuania on 20-22 October 2002. It focused on discussing means for protecting and supporting the victims of trafficking in women. Among speakers were several ministers from Nordic and Baltic countries.

The third joint seminar "*Action for the Future*" was held in Riga, Latvia on 27-28 November 2002, and it focused on three themes: prevention, protection and prosecution. Again, several ministers of gender equality gave speech, and in the closing, the need for future cooperation was emphasised by all ministers.

Members of the Nordic-Baltic working group against trafficking in women and national coordinators participated in all seminars, they gave speeches and moderated workshops held during the seminars.

The idea to have joint seminars in addition to national activities was very good one. It gave the possibility not only to catch up with your colleagues, but it gave lots of useful and valuable information about the topics discussed during the campaign. Also, it gave the sense of real cooperation, feeling of partnership and united force. And of course, because the organised crime is able to have very good cross border cooperation, it is more than necessary that state and nations against trafficking in women have even

better cooperation. Ministers meetings and international seminars are one of the tools for creating this cooperation.

The seminar in Riga was in a way the most interesting one, also it had remarkably many male speakers. I hope this is the change of attitudes for example common in Estonia – that trafficking in women is women's problem. The seminar in Tallinn had widest audience and it was interesting as there were many important topics I consider crucial in the fight against trafficking in women – women's status, the role of media, and legislation. Women's status is low in Estonia, the media is playing the main role as pimp and re-creator of gender stereotypes, and though the legislation exists, it is not working in real life.

b. Web site

It was decided in the first working group meeting that there is need for joint website and that the website for the Nordic-Baltic campaign will be placed and maintained in one of the Baltic countries. The task of finding the suitable server, finding and contracting the designer-webmaster was given to Estonian national coordinator, as well as the obligation to maintain the website together with the webmaster. The address of the website is <http://www.nordicbalticcampaign.org>. Each country has its own site attached to the general site, and all information regarding joint seminars, including speeches, is made available there. It is one of the most valuable tools the campaign had/has. Though the official campaign is over, the website remains (at least in present). It is excellent for disseminating information, especially as Estonians use Internet a lot. It looks good and it is easy and relatively cheap to maintain it. Unfortunately, not all countries have taken this part of the cooperation seriously, which is the loss for everyone, not knowing exactly, what your partners in other countries are doing. If used efficiently, it gives the best possibilities to express the message. We shall hope that the website will stay up for years and that it will be developed to a valuable source of information.

The Estonian site gives overview of the campaign activities such as lectures and trainings, the research done on prostitution and trafficking in women in Estonia, contact information of organisations and people dealing with trafficking issues, links to other interesting sites, as well as collected articles from Estonian media.

c. Logo.

It was decided in the first working group meeting in February 2002 that the Nordic-Baltic campaign against trafficking in women should have a logo of its own. It helps to make the publications and programs of the campaign more visible, and it's something that unites the national campaigns visually. The task of finding a logo was given to Estonian national coordinator. Together with the NCM information bureau in Tallinn, several possible authors were contacted and suitable logos forwarded for the working group. The final version of the logo was designed by Estonian artist Heikki Tikas and approved by the whole Nordic-Baltic working group. Since then, the official logo has been used on the seminar invitations, publications, ads, and naturally on the website.

3. Legal framework

The provisions relating to prostitution are placed in the Penal Code's chapter on offences against public order.

Pimping (procuration), or providing premises for the purposes of prostitution or other illegal activities, is punishable by a pecuniary punishment or up to 5 years' imprisonment.

Penal Code enacts that a person who by inducement, threat or any other act influences a person of less than 18 years of age in order to cause him or her to commence or continue prostitution, but the act does not have the necessary elements of an offence of enslaving or compelling person to engage in sexual intercourse, shall be punished by a pecuniary punishment or up to 3 years' imprisonment. The person being accused of this offence can also be under 18. Prostitution refers here to offering a service that includes either sexual intercourse or satisfaction of sexual desire in a manner other than sexual intercourse (also striptease). In latter case only when there is a personal contact between prostituting person and client. It is important to mention that if underage person, being afraid of the threat starts prostituting him/herself or continues such acts because of being afraid, the offence turns into enslaving.(see next chapter)

Aiding prostitution involving a person of less than 18 years of age by mediation, provision of premises or in any other manner is punishable by a pecuniary punishment or up to 5 years' imprisonment. The same act, if committed by a legal person, is punishable by a pecuniary punishment. Mediation here means procuration. "In any other manners" refers to pimping but also to advice, monetary support etc.

Trafficking in Human Beings

Estonia is a party of the International Agreement for the Suppression of the "White Slave Traffic" and International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children. These international instruments are a constituent part of the Estonian legal system and have superior powers over the laws of the Republic of Estonia.

With the coming into force of new Penal Code Estonia has had more opportunities in legislation to fight the trafficking in human beings. Previously Estonian law did not deal with trafficking in persons except for the explicit provision of the Criminal Code on sale and purchase of children.

According to the Penal Code the sale or purchase of children is punishable by 1 to 5 years' imprisonment. The same act, if committed by a legal person, is punishable by a pecuniary punishment.

Enslaving is considered to be an offence against liberty. Penal Code states that placing a human being, through violence or deceit, in a situation where he or she is forced to work or perform other duties against his or her will for the benefit of another person, or keeping a person in such situation, is punishable by 1 to 5 years' imprisonment. The same act, if committed against two or more persons, or against a person of less than 18 years of age, is punishable by 3 to 12 years' imprisonment. The commentaries

to that article show clearly that it can also be used in cases of trafficking in women. Deceit is supposed to refer both to the situation where person has been promised high salary but will not get it later and also when person is allured to other country with a promise of a regular job and good salary but in that other country is forced to work as a prostituting person.

Abduction is taking or leaving a person, through violence or deceit, in a state where it is possible to persecute or humiliate him or her on grounds of race or gender or for other reasons, and where he or she lacks legal protection against such treatment and does not have the possibility to leave the state. Abduction is punishable by a pecuniary punishment or up to 5 years' imprisonment. The same act, if committed against two or more persons, or against a person of less than 18 years of age, is punishable by 2 to 10 years' imprisonment.

An article of unlawful deprivation of liberty of another person could also be used when trafficked person is being restricted from leaving the premises where she is forced to work. Unlawful deprivation of the liberty of another person is punishable by a pecuniary punishment or up to 5 years' imprisonment. The same act, if committed against a person of less than 18 years of age, is punishable by 1 to 5 years' imprisonment.

The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organised Crime, was signed in Palermo in December 14, 2002. At the moment, it is being harmonised by the Ministry of Internal Affairs. It is planned to send the Protocol to the Estonian Parliament *Riigikogu* during the first half of the year 2003. *Riigikogu* should ratify the Protocol by the end of the year 2003.

4. National activities

The Estonian members of the Nordic Baltic Working Group Against Trafficking in Women were Ülle-Marike Papp from the Ministry of Social Affairs, and Imbi Markus from the Ministry of Justice. Kristiina Luht was hired for the Estonian national coordinator's position.

The basis of the Estonian campaign was planned by a group of researchers, NGO representatives, and the Bureau of Equality in the Ministry of Social Affairs. The campaign activities were implemented by the national coordinator Kristiina Luht and cooperation partners such as Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre (Leen Kadakas, Marion Pajumets), NGO Living for Tomorrow (Sirle Blumberg), Estonian Open Society Institute (Helve Kase, Iris Pettai), Estonia Institute for Humanities (Marion Pajumets, Aljona Kurbatova) and the Bureau of Equality (Ülle-Marike Papp, Käthlin Sander, Katri Tammekand). Other partners were the Legal Information Centre for Human Rights (Lilja Ivanchenko), Ida-Virumaa Women's Union (Ene-Eha Urbala), and individuals from different organisations, mainly non-governmental ones. NCM information bureau in Tallinn helped by consulting and technical issues. The meetings took place in the beginning of the Estonian campaign for the planning process, as well as during the whole campaign according to the needs of special activities. The results of campaign activities and research were discussed in a group

consisting of researchers, NGO members, governmental officials and NCM bureau representatives. The cooperation between these active individuals and organisations will continue after the campaign, as the planning and implementing of the Estonian campaign created strong connections between different parties.

Estonian campaign consisted of 8 different projects, implemented by different organisations in close cooperation with the national coordinator and the Bureau of Equality at the Ministry of Social Affairs. The final seminar was organised in cooperation with the NCM information bureau in Tallinn.

Project title	Responsible organisation
Prostitution and trafficking in women as unsolved problems in Estonia – Estonia's states' ability to stop and prevent prostitution and trafficking in women (research project)	Estonian Open Society Institute
Female high school graduates' awareness on trafficking in women (research project)	Estonian Institute of Humanities
Training courses on trafficking in women	Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre
Community's role in prevention of trafficking – educational meetings	National coordinator
8 days youth workshop Living for Tomorrow – information day on trafficking in women	NGO Living for Tomorrow
Information leaflet	Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre
Essay competition on trafficking in women	National coordinator
Seminar for governmental officials and parliamentarians – concluding the Estonian campaign	Nordic Council of Ministers Information Bureau and Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre

Project descriptions

a) Prostitution and trafficking in women as unsolved problem in Estonia – Estonia's states' ability to stop and prevent prostitution and trafficking in women (research project).

Projects goal was to compile information material, that would enable to map the situation on trafficking and prostitution: their spread, forms and networks in Estonia; and that would clarify, what is Estonia's civil servants' (border guard and customs, police, lawyers, embassy workers) readiness to stop and prevent prostitution and trafficking in women. The research material was prepared as a report that can be used for developing national strategy on stopping and preventing trafficking in women.

Information gained:

- Estonia's state ability and readiness to stop and prevent prostitution and trafficking in women. Based on interviews with experts from different fields;
- Estonia's participation in international networks against trafficking in women and prostitution;

- Neighbouring countries practices in fighting trafficking in women and prostitution.

Five polls were conducted under this project and following subjects were interviewed:

- a) Evaluation on prostitution and trafficking by 100 policemen in Tallinn
- b) Employment agencies who broke work force to Western countries; their activities
- c) Companies who broke sex services, their methods
- d) Youth workers attitudes towards prostitution and trafficking in women
- e) Interviews with experts from different fields: Boarder Guard, Interpol, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Justice, etc.

Based on this information, some principles for Estonian national strategy on stopping and preventing trafficking in women were developed.

b) Female high school graduates' awareness on trafficking in women (research project)

The aim of this project was to find out girls' current attitudes towards working abroad, to find out whether they can see the connection between the seemingly respectable jobs advertised in the newspapers and prostitution, to find out how uncritical and vulnerable are the potential victims. The information was gathered through sociological group-interviews by sociologists Marion Pajumets and Aljona Kurbatova. Eight interviews with eight groups were conducted in order to gather diverse data. Each group consisted of four to six girls. Four of the interviews were carried out in Tallinn and the others in Narva, Pärnu, Tartu and Kuressare. Different groups were formed. Some of them were recruited from elite schools and some from the ordinary and inferior schools. Two groups, one in Tallinn and the other in Narva were composed of Russian speakers. Each interview lasted approximately two hours. The data was analysed and reports were presented both in Estonian and in English. Reports are available in Internet.

Issues covered in the interviews with young girls were such as:

1. What kind of plans girls have after graduating the high school?
2. Attitudes towards working abroad
3. What kind of jobs are most popular among them, and why.
4. How much girls know about the possible dangers involved.
5. Where is their awareness and attitudes from (school, family, friends, media, films, books).
6. Connection between the jobs that are advertised in the newspapers and prostitution
7. Attitudes towards trafficking and its victims.
8. What could be the channel used for preventive information.

c) Training courses on how to prevent trafficking in women

The basis for the training course was the idea that awareness raising and access to information are the most immediate needs in the prevention process. Target groups were high school teachers, school psychologists, youth workers, hobby group teachers, and job counsellors. We wanted to introduce the concept of trafficking in women, its reasons and consequences, to acknowledge risk groups; to give methods, how to introduce this topic to students and youth in classes, hobby groups and career interviews; to introduce educational institutions' role in prevention, and to give citizens a sense of empowerment that they can affect social change for the better.

Three groups of people (altogether 64 persons) were trained during this project in autumn 2002. One group was trained in Tallinn, one in Jõhvi, Ida-Virumaa, and one in Pärnu, South-Western-Estonia. The training was given in two parts: one two-day session on Friday-Saturday, and one session after a week to discuss mostly future activities. Training program covered trafficking in women related to topics such as gender stereotypes, media, violence against women, prostitution, drugs, STD, AIDS, and poverty. Information material was put together with all the speeches, game descriptions and articles related to discussed issues. Training courses were also used to gather information on youth workers attitudes towards prostitution and trafficking in women, to be analysed in the report "Prostitution and trafficking in women as unsolved problem in Estonia".

The training sessions included lectures by experts on prostitution, trafficking and related themes; videos; group sessions and discussions; games. Sessions were based on co-operative learning methodology, that has been used by *Living for Tomorrow* in its work with youth about sexual education, and which has proved to be successful.

The training courses were concluded with the seminar in Tallinn in January 2003, where all participants of the training courses were invited. They shared their experience in using the information gained. In addition, police officer Enrik Luts described the activities of Estonian Police regarding prostitution and trafficking in women, and Helve Kase introduced the research done among Estonian companies mediating work. Seminar was connected with the essay competition, the best writers were invited to participate and to receive their prizes.

d) Community's role in prevention of trafficking – educational meetings

The general aim of this project was to raise community's awareness on trafficking in women. Other aims were introducing the concept of trafficking in women, its reasons and consequences; introducing ways how to prevent trafficking; giving guidelines what to do, if this happens to someone; analysing attitudes towards victim, and most of all, introducing community's role in prevention. Aims were realised through educational evenings/lectures for people who can effect, help and guide young people, and who can affect certain processes in the community. We decided to give participants of this project basic knowledge about trafficking in women and its different aspects, and also guidelines for dealing with these matters. Target groups were social workers, local municipality leaders, local police, representatives of women's roundtables, teachers, representatives from student organisations.

Meetings took place in North-West Estonia, South Estonia, Central Estonia and Western Estonia. Lectures included two parts: introduction to the topic (including examples, guidelines, and practical information) and discussion, where participants were able to ask questions and share their experiences. Each lecture was approximately 2 hours long. In addition, information leaflets about trafficking and also about how to go safely abroad were disseminated. Local coordinators were found to help in finding participants, as well as free rooms for meetings. It was planned for 160 people, but, altogether, 251 people participated, and the lectures were held in 9 towns: Paldiski, Kiviõli, Kohtla-Järve, Sillamäe, Viljandi, Võhma, Narva, Kuressaare and Türi. Two lectures were held by Lilja Ivanchenko from Human Rights Information Centre in Russian, as local community speaks mainly Russian language. Also,

lectures there were concentrating more on work-related issues, not general problems, because unemployment there is high and people really desire to find a job abroad. Lectures were different according to the target group: students were treated like potential job-searchers, grown-ups were treated like responsible ones for the social problems, as a source for changing the situation.

e) Youth workshop Living for Tomorrow – information day on trafficking in women and prostitution

The aim of this project was to give young people age 14-18 information about trafficking and prostitution, which are strongly connected to other issues discussed in 8-day seminar: gender issues, sexual health awareness and safety, drugs, HIV/AIDS, STD. As so far up to 50% of youngsters educated by Living for Tomorrow continue voluntary work in NGO, the aim of this project was also to train trainers who will pass information on learned issues on to their co-students and other young people. Altogether, 30 young people participated from 15 different schools. Lectures were combined with interactive games, discussions, and audiovisual information. The interactive method is more effective with young people, as they would not like to sit in lectures, reminding them of ordinary school.

f) Information leaflet

It was planned to have short informative material on trafficking, easy to disseminate everywhere and to everyone. Precise content and aims were to be decided later. After reaching good cooperation with International Organisation for Migration, it was decided to use IOM's information leaflets, as duplicating would have been waste of resources. Instead, informative post cards and bookmarks for the international website <http://www.nordicbalticcampaign.org> were created. The website enables to add new information all the time and is therefore relevant and effective for information dissemination. What was needed was the information about the website itself. Bookmarks have the address of the website and the name of the campaign on them.

The postcards have following sentences on them:

Want to know:

- What is trafficking in women?
- What is prostitution?
- Why do women sell their bodies?
- Who buys sex?
- What media thinks?
- What researchers conclude?
- How is the problem dealt in Nordic countries?
- What I going on in Estonia?

Look at:

<http://www.nordicbalticcampaign.org>

The postcards and bookmarks can be disseminated also in the future when the official campaign is finished, as the website will stay up. Printed materials are small-sized, easy to disseminate, hold in your pocket or between books etc. Internet is very popular among Estonian youth and also governmental officials use it as their work tool, so this is very efficient way for raising awareness on trafficking in women and related issues.

g) Essay competition on trafficking in women

The aim of the essay competition was to make young people age 12-24 think about trafficking in women. Giving prizes was to be motivating for young people, who otherwise wouldn't have done extra job in addition to school responsibilities. The competition was announced in October 2002 and re-announced in November 2002. Organisers of the competition received 37 writings from different parts of Estonia. Eight best essays were selected – three main prizes, one special prize, and four additional prizes. Authors of the best essays were invited to the seminar on trafficking in women, where the conclusion of the competition was made and prizes given.

h) Seminar for governmental officials and parliamentarians – concluding the Estonian campaign

The seminar finished the Nordic-Baltic campaign in Estonia. High-level authorities, parliamentarians, and ministers were invited; the interest was bigger than expected. 92 persons participated. The seminar was organised in cooperation with NCM information bureau in Tallinn and the Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre. The Minister of Social Affairs Siir Oviir gave overview about work done in Estonia against trafficking in women. High-level officials from the Ministry of Social Affairs, Ministry of Internal Affairs, Ministry of Justice, and Legal Chancellor's Office gave speeches on their role in preventing and stopping trafficking in women. It was a media event, noticed in all levels. Daily newspapers *Eesti Päevaleht*, *Postimees* and *Õhtuleht* wrote about the seminar, main radio stations such as *Kuku* and *Eesti Raadio* took interviews from national coordinator and the Minister of Social Affairs. *Vikerraadio* made 45 minutes program on the topic of trafficking in women and job broking in Estonia, inviting national coordinator and researcher Helve Kase to the studio.

Results of the activities

The knowledge about trafficking has been very little in Estonia in general. Groups with critical role in helping and guiding young people do not know about the trafficking in women, or their knowledge is very little and often full of stereotypes. Because of that they also do not know how to prevent trafficking or how to help victims. Very serious issues are the negative attitudes towards victims, and existing stereotypical ideas about prostitution. The aims of the campaign - to increase knowledge and awareness among the public, and to initiate discussion about the problems surrounding the issue of trafficking in women – were crucial to reach, as there have been discussions about legalising prostitution in Estonia, which would make the fight against trafficking in and exploitation of women extremely difficult if not impossible.

Research on Estonian situation

We decided to study the *Estonian state's ability to stop and prevent prostitution and trafficking in women*, because it was already aware that the ability was little. What we needed was to find out the reasons and also to hear specialists' opinion about the situation.

According to the research, it is clear that for traffickers Estonia is easy place where to operate. The Estonian state has no information about the number of labour agencies; labour mediation is conducted under the sign of cultural exchange. There is no control

over the activities of unlicensed firms, and the illegal labour mediation firms are highly mobile, which complicates their monitoring and investigation. Women leaving for work abroad have no practical opportunities to check the background of the mediating firm. The state has practically no control over what is actually going on in the Estonian labour mediation market. There are approximately 30 firms daily engaged in the mediation of prostitutes, although procurement of women is banned by law in Estonia. The threat to become a victim of human trafficking is very high, according to the police estimate. Civil servants are not well informed of prostitution and the accompanying trafficking in women, the state institutions, whose competence should directly involve the prevention of prostitution and trafficking in women as well as aid to victims, often fail to see their role in it. Many departments and institutions, which should be involved in the prevention of prostitution, have no missions in that area. Many state officials and leading specialists favour the legalisation of prostitution. It is clear that the legislative organs are not concentrating on the prevention of trafficking, protection of victim and prosecution of traffickers.

The research did not only point out some of the problems, but offered possible solutions – basis for Estonian national strategy on stopping and preventing trafficking in women (see Suggestions).

Talking about the research on *female high school students' awareness on trafficking*, we decided that it is important to find out how much the “normal” not yet trafficked girls know about the possible dangers involved.

Based on the study material, one cannot identify any one group as being clearly more at risk than the others. Girls from different environments are vulnerable to human trafficking for different reasons. Girls in East-Viru know about trafficking and are aware that they belong in a risk group. They try to protect themselves to a degree, but in comparison to the Estonian language high school female graduates and Tallinn's Russian high school female graduates, it is unusually difficult for them to find work in Estonia. The economic situation and lack of long-term prospects may cause those young women to seek work abroad. Those Russian-speaking girls wanted to leave Estonia at the first opportunity. In this respect, the non-Estonian young women in Estonia are more aware of the dangers than their ethnic Estonian counter-parts, but they are also more inclined to take risks.

The girls from middle-class Estonian speaking families have been living in friendly environment and they do not understand why anyone would have harmful plans for them. Unlike the girls from the other ethnic communities, young Estonians are used to feeling at home, being in the majority and the decision-makers. They may not be able to imagine a situation where the environment forces them into a humiliating and undesirable situation. Especially the upper-class Estonian girls may feel themselves to be in command and as decision- makers.

The attitude of many of the Estonian girls participating in the study can be considered unreal. They lack clear understanding how the world beyond their country's borders sees them. They see well-paid adventure in their foreign jobs and assume that foreigners think the same. Estonian language speaking girls' naively optimistic attitude stems from the Estonian peoples' ambivalent situation. Girls that have not had to think about details may think that language and work permit are just a bother - everything will go as smoothly as it always has.

If talking about possible dangers and useful preparations before accepting a job offer abroad, the awareness of possible danger was little or non-existing. Even if knowing

about trafficking cases, they were considered unreal, the main attitude was “it cannot happen to me.” This is quite general attitude among Estonia youth, as can be concluded after the lectures and private conversations with young people.

Research report was made and it formed the basis for subsequent preventive activities of the Estonian team, especially training courses for local youth-educators, who had to be informed of the existing attitudes, myths, associations and problems among youth. The information on girls’ views and expectations was used in addressing and targeting the campaign against trafficking in women better. It was good to have that kind of information to present not only for campaign target groups, but also to journalists, both Estonian and foreign, and to other interested parts we reached during the campaign. Without this research, it would have been difficult to explain to the public why there is need for such information campaign, why are Estonian girls potential victims of trafficking, and why it is needed to start talking about trafficking-related issues in schools.

Educational activities in Estonia

All educational activities were held the way they were planned and it can be said that they reached the goals set. Awareness was raised, and what is most important, the attitudes were very often changed.

Training courses were planned to raise the feeling of responsibility among teachers and youth workers. The last day was mostly for discussions about future activities, and already then, most participants expressed ideas and wish to continue sharing the knowledge gained during the course. Trainers asked from youth workers very concrete suggestions, and every participant gave her/his thoughts. In the final seminar in January, all the participants of the courses were invited together, and most active ones described their activities after the course. It was remarkable to notice that these people did really care about the topic, as many of them had even developed a shorter course for schools (members of the Tartu Child Support Centre), developed a program, how to talk about these things specially with boys (assistant director of a mainly boy-school), had had special evening in school on the topic, one had written an article to the biggest Estonian women’s magazine *Eesti Naine*, also, an analysing and informative article about the course was written to the *Pärnu Postimees* by journalist, who participated almost the whole three-day course, etc. Job chancellors had started warning job seekers about possible problems and explaining how to search job abroad. After starting discussions with unemployed women, it appeared, that many of them had already experienced violence and attempts of trafficking.

Attitudes towards prostitution and trafficking in women were variable. In some towns it was easy to find cooperation partners and participants for lectures and courses, as the problem was considered important, in others it was not so easy. For example, the interest for lectures and a course was not as big in North-West Estonia compared to Tallinn and South Estonia, where for the training course, we had to turn down candidates, though unemployment is higher and the problem very much visible more in North-West Estonia.

Analysing the project of *educational evenings*, very interesting attitudes were found. Different groups responded differently to the topic. Lectures were held for mixed groups, and especially in North-West Estonia, the difference between young peoples’

opinion and grownups' opinion was remarkable. Stereotypical thinking, accusation of victims were more common among grownups, sometimes it was impossible to change the thinking (as it was mentioned by participants, one lecture is not enough to change your ideology). It is worrisome situation, as many of these people were teachers, youth workers, who share their thoughts with youngsters, therefore modelling their attitudes towards the issue.

Students participating in the lectures were quit unaware of trafficking in women, but they were also the ones with very open mind, being sincerely interested in the issue. A lot of questions were asked, especially by the Russian speaking youth. In Võhma, evaluation sheets were filled, and the lecture was highly appreciated. The reponse was very positive also in Paldiski, Viljandi, Kuressaare and Kiviõli. Attitudes towards the problem were very different if comparing North-West Estonia and South Estonia. The most important difference appeared when analysing the community's role in prevention. It was common in North-West Estonia, specially in Narva, to expect help from outside – foreign money, foreign experts, all kind of activity and support from other institutions to solve their problems. The situation was different in other parts of Estonia. The idea to seek local coordinators was also to support active citizenship; in most places, this decision was very fruitful. Very positive examples were Viljandi and Paldiski, both meetings included active people, each of them representing 2-3 organisations.

Target groups were satisfied with the projects, most of them found the information gained if not useful, interesting. Even people who claimed to be familiar with the issue said that they got new information. Groups consisting of active people found the lectures also the most useful. Groups for the training courses were active anyways, as they had decided to spend three whole days learning.

5. Cooperation with NGO's

The importance of collaboration with national women's organizations and local NGOs that have extensive knowledge and experiences in working against prostitution and trafficking cannot be underestimated. The activities of the Estonian campaign against trafficking in women were organised mainly by NGOs. The Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre and NGO Living for Tomorrow developed and held training courses for teachers, youth workers and job counsellors. NGO Living for Tomorrow held youth seminar on sexual education, discussing prostitution and trafficking in women. Estonian Open Society Institute made research on Estonian state's ability to stop and prevent trafficking in women and prostitution. They conducted five original studies, plus studied the research done so far in Estonia on these issues. Also, EOSI researcher Helve Kase gave lectures during the training course for teachers, introducing the research results. The Estonian Institute of Humanities conducted research on female high school graduate's awareness on trafficking in human, study that had great impact for the campaign, describing the attitudes of young Estonian women, both Estonian and Russian speaking. Researcher Marion Pajumets also lectured during the training courses.

Other non-governmental partners were the Legal Information Centre for Human Rights (LICHR), and Ida-Virumaa Women's Union. Lilja Ivanchenko from LICHR

helped in conducting lectures in Russian-speaking areas. Ida-Virumaa Women's Union helped in organising lectures in Ida-Viru area, finding local coordinators, and also in organising training course for teachers in Jõhvi. We had collaboration also with AIDS Information and Support Centre, its specialist Jüri Kalikov gave lectures during the training courses. There was collaboration with NGO Citizen Training Centre and NGO Social Program Centre.

The collaboration with NGOs was very successful. There are active and strong NGOs in Estonia who have the expertise and also the will to change things. The only problem NGOs have is the lack of funds, as they mostly work project-basis. The Nordic-Baltic campaign gave finances to improve the knowledge base of the NGOs participating in the campaign, as it gave the possibility to learn more about trafficking and prostitution. NGOs do not have the obstacles governmental agencies do, so their cooperation is often more fruitful. This time, there was good cooperation between the NGOs participating in the campaign and the Bureau of Equality in the Ministry of Social Affairs, which proved there could be successful cooperation between NGOs and GOs. The cooperation with NGOs participating in the campaign will definitely continue in the future.

6. Evaluation of effects of joint and national activities

The interest towards the topic of the campaign has grown significantly since the beginning of the campaign. It is especially visible in the media. The discussion started in February 2002 when IOM started its media campaign; the comments from media side were quit non-professional and often extremely stereotypical. Also, the comments from the public (in the Internet portals) were mostly accusing the victims of trafficking and emphasising the need for and the tradition of prostitution, being something normal, and something you should not fight. The change has been remarkable. Not only that there have been rise in the amount of articles (there were few also before the campaign), but also the content of writings has changed. Beginning February 2002, there have been more than 40 articles in the main daily newspapers *Eesti Päevaleht* and *Postimees*. More than half of them are analysing the situation, being more than just news articles. Two biggest women's monthly journals, *Eesti Naine* and *Anna*, have published articles about trafficking in women, based on interviews with campaign coordinator and researchers. Estonian Television has shown series called "Weaker Sex", its 9 episodes concentrating on prostitution and trafficking in women, gender roles, women's political participation in the society, etc. This TV show produced in cooperation with the Nordic Council of Ministers has also had very big impact in the discussion about trafficking in women. The interest by radio stations has been remarkable. One of the main radio stations in Estonia, *Vikerraadio* had the 45-minute show after final seminar, concentrating on the companies mediating job abroad and the possible dangers involved in illegal work. These shows will continue, each concentrating on different aspect of trafficking in women. Russian-language *Raadio-4* started its shows on trafficking in women and prostitution in March, and there will be 4 additional shows following the first one. There was also seminar for journalists, organised by the Citizen Training Centre, and some journalists participated in the trainings organised by the Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre. As a result of the good media contacts, some journalists

have started asking advice when writing articles about the issue. This can be considered very important effect.

As a response from the NGO side, some additional NGOs have also started independently working with the issues of trafficking in women and prostitution. The training seminar for journalists on trafficking and violence against women organised by the NGO Citizen Training Centre is one example; the NGO Social Program Centre's lectures on the topic is other. Both NGOs have negotiated with the campaign coordinator when planning activities, and the cooperation has been very good.

From the authorities side, the cooperation has been different depending on the authority. The cooperation with the Ministry of Social Affairs has been good; the Bureau of Equality has given full support and input to the campaign. The Minister of Social Affairs, Siiri Oviir has participated in the international seminars in Estonia and Latvia, and given speeches on the topic.

Cooperation with some individuals from the Police Board and from the Central Criminal Police has been good. The response of the Ministry of Justice and the Ministry of Internal Affairs has been poor. It was difficult to get the attention of the Ministry of Internal Affairs, and there was no real cooperation with the Ministry of Justice, though the international working group against trafficking in women had even a member from the Ministry of Justice. Unfortunately it can be said that the topic is not considered important by the mentioned ministries, and this is something that needs to be changed. The research on states' ability to fight trafficking also pointed out the lack of knowledge and understanding of the problem among governmental officials, and considering that, it can be understood why the response from their side was so poor. Then again, the final seminar in March 2003 brought together 92 persons, 2/3 of them governmental officials, which means they have started noticing the problem. It can be said that the campaign has affected them at least in some point.

Speaking about foreign authorities, the campaign has reached mainly two countries represented in Estonia. Swedish Embassy has shown great interest in fighting trafficking in women in Estonia, consulting with national coordinator, supporting training for journalists, lectures for school children and essay competition for high school students. The US Embassy has been cooperating with the organisers of the Nordic-Baltic campaign in Estonia in planning future activities, mostly prevention of trafficking. US Department of State organised training on fight against trafficking in women in USA, inviting among participants from Latvia and Lithuania also the Estonian national coordinator of the Nordic-Baltic campaign.

The campaign had fruitful impact on public level. Firstly, there is at least general awareness about the existence of trafficking in women. This was not so when we started with the campaign. The media has done a lot, and also the lectures held around Estonia and the training courses for teachers have had impact. The aim of the campaign – to increase knowledge, raise awareness and initiate discussions about trafficking in women, has been fulfilled. The campaign has given good basis for future work.

7. Other perceived effects of Nordic Baltic Campaign and national campaigns – regionally and nationally

The main effect of the Nordic Baltic campaign against trafficking in women in Estonia has been the increased knowledge about the problem, bigger awareness on the issue generally and on the possible prevention, and public discussions about trafficking in women and prostitution. Also, the campaign activities have created connections between different organisations and individuals, both NGO/GO level, interested in fighting trafficking in women in Estonia. With these new connections, it is possible to effect the situation in the future.

8. Future work against trafficking in women

For effective prevention, protection and prosecution, the national action plan against prostitution and trafficking in human beings should be developed. There should be national working group on trafficking in women and prostitution. Members of this group should represent different ministries, boards, and NGOs.

Initiating and continuing support for prevention projects is crucial. Educating different target groups can be considered the most important task. In Estonia, awareness raising should continue among vulnerable groups (women and children particularly, especially in areas with high unemployment rate), and among groups in position of preventing trafficking in women – governmental officials, NGOs, youth educators, journalists.

The work of the Bureau of Equality at the Ministry of Social Affairs will continue. Among its objectives is addressing discrimination and gender equality, unemployment and poverty as the roots of trafficking in women. The lobby for the Law of Gender Equality proposal will continue by the Bureau of Equality and by women's NGOs. In 2003, NGO AIDS Information and Support Centre will start collaboration with youth counselling centres around Estonia, making them resource centres on trafficking in human. The staff will be trained and information leaflets disseminated to youngsters, who are searching for job abroad. International Organisation for Migration and NGO Legal Information Centre of Human Rights will continue with the hotlines for trafficking victims and job seekers. The Estonian Women's Studies and Resource Centre will try to continue with training for teachers and youth workers, the work depends on financing. Also, there is plan to train police officers. NGO Living for Tomorrow will have seminars for young people age 14-18 on sexual education, including prostitution and trafficking in women.

Estonian Ministry of Internal Affairs is planning to organise in the near future a roundtable meeting for all the ministries having responsibilities regarding trafficking in human and prostitution. The aim of this meeting is to make the responsibilities and tasks visible and clear for all ministries. This is a very big step towards effective collaboration between Estonian ministries in the fight against trafficking and prostitution.

Estonian Ministry of Internal Affairs is also harmonising The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children,

Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organised Crime. It is planned to send the Protocol to the Estonian Parliament *Riigikogu* during the first half of the year 2003. *Riigikogu* should ratify the Protocol by the end of the year 2003. Ratifying this Protocol is important step in the work against trafficking in women in Estonia.

The future work against trafficking in Estonia regarding prevention, prosecution and protection should include following:

Educating the public and improving awareness of the essence and consequences of prostitution and trafficking with women.

- publication of educational materials – compilation and issue of booklets, books etc.;
- organising a campaign condemning prostitution as violence against women and girls;
- starting a discussion in the media on the threat of prostitution to the entire Estonian society;
- expert study and analysis of media favouring prostitution (the press, pornographic publications, the Internet).

Improving the capability of the police to prevent prostitution and trafficking with women.

- launching a continuous training system and schooling specially trained police officers;
- development of instructions and action programmes for the improvement of the efficiency of police activities.

Education of civil servants and specialists on prostitution and trafficking with women.

- training programme for civil servants, , medics, teachers, etc.

Improvement and development of legislation.

- expert study of the existing legislation to determine the access to protection and legal aid of the victimised women;
- the development of new legislation, which would cover all forms of sexual exploitation of women, in particular trafficking with women;

Adjustment of the courts and legal system.

- development of a courts and legal system, which would protect the dignity and privacy of prostitutes and victims of trafficking with women and ensure their safety (special courts, specialised prosecutors, witness protection programmes etc.);
- briefing and training of individuals working in the legal system.

Establishment of an institutional cooperation network for aid to prostitutes and victims of trafficking with women.

- mapping of the needs of the victims (medical, psychological, legal etc.);
- establishment of an integrated support network (safe houses, confidential and information telephones etc.);
- rehabilitation centres for prostitutes and victims of trafficking with women;
- training of a victims support network;
- training of specialists for participation in international cooperation network.

Surveys and monitoring.

- establishment and development of a statistical information system to provide an overview of the extent and forms of prostitution and trafficking with women (the police, the Border Guard, Citizenship and Migration Board, foreign

embassies, medical institutions, safe houses, shelters, consultation offices, confidential telephones, AIDS Prevention Centre, etc.)

- launching a sociological monitoring system for the organisation of surveys.

In addition to all that, there should be developed a system of indicators, which would enable to evaluate the efficiency of the national strategy.

9. Recommendations for the future collaboration in the region and nationally.

There is serious need to reinforce regional and international cooperation against trafficking, including both governments and NGOs in the countries of origin, transit and destination.

In the region, the cross-border collaboration among ministries, police forces, researchers and NGOs should continue and tighten, and created, where it does not yet exist, or improved, where it is still on paper only. The Nordic countries have expertise in fighting trafficking in women as violence against women, and their expertise could and should be used in Baltic countries. The cooperation should be in all levels: in prevention, protection and prosecution.

The government of Estonia should start taking the work against prostitution and trafficking in women and children as a political priority. This is very difficult to reach, so there is constant need for pressure by Nordic countries as our close neighbours. It means that the Nordic-Baltic collaboration in ministerial level should definitely continue and the Working Group Against Trafficking in Women should continue.

Prevention of trafficking in women

Bilateral agreements between destination countries and the countries of origin of victims should be established, which should cover legal and police cooperation and humanitarian aspects of the problem, including information and prevention campaigns. Nordic and Baltic countries should continue cooperation in governmental level as well as NGO level, creating awareness-rising campaigns or single activities addressing trafficking in women and prostitution.

Special police services should be created and made aware of the fight against trafficking and prostitution. Police in Nordic and European Union countries could help in creating training programs for police forces in countries of origin. Baltic police could visit their colleagues in other countries and to gain experience in police work against trafficking.

Prevention programs focusing in particular on the deep-seated causes of trafficking in women, namely the inequality between women and men on the labour market, the feminisation of poverty and violence against women should be created and launched. Support programs should be established aiming at the full participation and empowerment of women in educational facilities and economic life, including support for female entrepreneurship. International collaboration can provide expertise as well as financial support for such programs.

Mass media should be encouraged to cover the work of fighting trafficking, and Nordic journalists could offer their experience in investigating cases they have discovered.

Introducing the Nordic values to the public has crucial role in changing existing attitudes towards prostitution and trafficking in women. The positive effects of Nordic policies regarding gender equality, labour market, violence against women should be introduced to target groups such as selected governmental official, police officers, high level authorities, whether through trainings or seminars.

Protection and assistance to those women and children that are victims of trafficking

In protection of those women and children that are victims of trafficking, more collaboration of police forces and court system in different countries is needed. There is victim protection agreement between Baltic countries (victim can be hid in one of the Baltic sates), but it is not yet enforced in Estonia. Also, this agreement is not very helpful when talking about hiding a victim, as Baltic countries are small and the victim can be easily tracked. There should be possibility to keep the victim in one of the Nordic countries, to ensure that she is not harmed in any way before the testimony. In assistance of those women and children, collaboration between NGOs and also the collaboration between police and NGOs is crucial. Government can use the help of NGOs for rehabilitating victims of trafficking and prostitution, giving them the help needed. This collaboration would definitely include financial support by state to NGOs. The government should finance shelters for trafficking victims that can be maintained by NGOs.

Joint training for Baltic police by Nordic experts should be organised, or separate training for each Baltic countries. New recruits of Police Academy should learn about trafficking in women, its prevention and prosecution of criminals, so they would recognise the indicators of trafficking related crimes and would fully realise their potential to identify and rescue victims.

In order to develop efficient and targeted prevention measures, there is need for improved data, research, and analysis, including on the character and scale of trafficking and exploitation mechanisms deployed by the organised criminal groups. Qualitative and quantitative data and information on all components and structures of trafficking should be made available and exchanged on a bilateral and multilateral basis. A crucial component in the comprehensive counter-trafficking response will be research and analysis of the demand side of the trafficking process and an examination of methods by which the demand of clients can be effectively reduced. The collaboration between Nordic and Baltic researchers is needed in order to create the knowledge needed for prevention as well as victim protection and assistance.

Prosecution of those groups and networks that traffic women and children for prostitution purposes

Government should make the existing legislation work. Estonian legislation enables to punish traffickers and pimps, but there has been only one case recently involving four pimps. This situation should change, and the collaboration between Estonian governmental and non-governmental level would help in making that change. For example, Estonian women's NGOs have managed to change the Parliament's action regarding the proposed Law on Gender Equality. The UN Trafficking Protocol will be ratified by the end of 2003, and the government should do everything needed to implement the Protocol in Estonia. Collaboration between government and NGOs would help to fulfil the demands of the Protocol.

In prosecution of groups and networks that traffic women and children for prostitution purpose, the effective collaboration between police forces of Nordic and Baltic countries is crucial. Exchange of information and experience is very much needed. The harmonisation of legislation in different countries to a certain level would help to make this collaboration effective.

Different measures to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children that leads to trafficking

Legislative, educational, social and cultural measures including bilateral and multilateral cooperation should be created and put into force to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking. In legislative side, Sweden has good example here and the Swedish law regulating buying of sexual services should be promoted in Estonia, presenting its positive effects. Swedish Ministry of Justice could have collaboration with the Estonian Ministry of Justice when it comes to preparing the legislation that criminalizes the buying of sexual act. The introduction of Nordic values has important role here. Educational measures can be used both by government and NGOs – the training of governmental officials and organising information campaigns for selected target groups (for example young man, police officials, social workers, etc) can be done in cooperation with government and NGOs. The vocational training for young people should change in Estonia, as at the moment the vocational education system is breaking apart and also the quality of it is weakening. The unemployment among youth is relatively high, so there is big need for educational measures.

The cultural measures fighting trafficking in women and children should include the reduction of demand and the changing of attitudes towards prostitution: educating the public about the negative results of prostitution for society and for individual; proper sexual education in schools; changing traditional gender stereotypes through education and awareness-rising activities.

The good cooperation between different organisations dealing with gender equality, women's empowerment, violence against women, prostitution and trafficking matters should continue. Projects should be discussed in advance so there would be no duplication, The Nordic Council of Ministers should continue supporting projects and activities fighting trafficking in women – educational, research and networking projects. All such project should include the demand to coordinate the activities. Government should also support activities against trafficking and create more such activities. The existing activities have been created mostly by the Nordic Baltic campaign and due to financial reasons, they will not continue after the end of the campaign as efficiently as they should.